BOOK REVIEWS

Phillips, Lynne and Sally Cole (eds.) 2013. Contesting Publics. Feminism, Activism, Ethnography. London: Pluto Press. xi + 192 pp. Pb.: £54.00. ISBN: 9780745332840.

In an era of continuous crises in participatory democracy in our increasingly global societies in which most social institutions are being challenged by liberalisation, commodification and privatisation practices (sadly, education and academia are no exception), Cole and Phillips offer a ground-breaking account of how feminists/activists are both challenged by and also challenging new spaces of participation. The book bridges the public/private debate in discussions of civil society and portrays how gendered concerns can illuminate explorations of social movements and social inequalities.

Within a period of three years, between 2006 and 2009, the authors interviewed feminist activists working in a variety of transnational networks and national democracy building projects in Latin America. The book is a fascinating journey of both the "routes and roots" of feminist activities and the authors' account of that research across a breadth of diversity of scales and spaces of political action. It is through a critical anthropological gaze and a sound theorisation of the private and public that we understand a wealth of issues, from the securitisation, hyper-sexualisation and commodification of women's bodies to the neo-liberalising globalisation and privatisation that have led to the increasing inequality and poverty that we witness today in a variety of publics. What is even more enticing is the fact that Contesting Publics not only documents new spaces of participation for women, it also discusses how these very same spaces may produce new exclusions, inequalities and silences. Through ethnographic contexts and a variety of encounters, Contesting Publics illuminates both the contradictions and re-inscriptions of publics while offering a platform to consider how we can re-invent such alternative publics for more inclusive feminist futures.

In terms of organisation, the introductory chapter situates the theoretical framework of how an ethnography of publics was set out and pursued, while three activist testimonies are interwoven among four ethnographic chapters. With diverse political agendas and strategies and work in a variety of organisations, the activist/public intellectual testimonies were selected from a range of conversations of the authors with activists in Ecuador and Brazil in 2007 and 2008. The interweaving of ethnography with activist testimony illuminates both the personal and the political in a fresh and fascinating way.

Three core arguments structure the theoretical foundations of the book: firstly, the authors propose that the public is not only a space of shifting power constellations but that the inequalities produced are very much such that social scientists are embedded within their domain; secondly, the public is contingent on the private so much so that this co-constitutive relationship is shifting but also critical to the analysis and, as such, they introduce the term "public-private", used by Wright in a chapter *Paradoxes, Protests, and the Mujeres de Negro of Northern Mexico* of the 2012 volume *Terrorizing Women: Feminicide in the Americas* (edited by Fregoso and Bejarno), to reflect the contingency of the relationship; and thirdly, the investigation of publics ethnographically enables both the re-examination in a critical perspective of conventional publics through a new lens, but also the theorisation of emergent ones.

Moreover, the authors are extremely accurate in underlying the importance of the scales of the public and publics as cultural spaces and draw particular attention to the fact that the space of civil society cannot be assumed to be a counter-public that is beneficial for women.

Within the above parameters, the book contributes expertly to the discussion on democracy projects and debates in Latin America by interrogating spaces. So that equality can hopefully move forward and materialise in productive ways for women. Chapter 2 depicts the range of opportunities, choices and compromises that women have to make as it introduces us to three households from which women's narratives illustrate their diverse roles and hence potential for transformation and innovation. Their storytelling of how new cultural norms and gender discourses are negotiated in households, neighbourhoods, factories and family activities are a hopeful indication of "liberdade" (freedom and implicitly rights). Nevertheless, a set of contradictory elements remains within the composition of the household, and this primarily relates to childcare, which remains the responsibility of women, as well as the stigmatisation of women who chose to leave a marriage or to live without a man.

Chapter 3 examines women, public spaces and sex tourism; the latter is considered as a new political space and also a contested public. This chapter presents Ponta Negra as a tourist district within the city of Natal, Brazil and the new spatial configurations that have shaped tensions over "race", class, sexuality and civility, while, through a critical les of the campaigns against sex tourism, the authors analyse the different interests underlying them while focusing on the various actors and institutions involved in these debates, such as the women engaging in sex tourism, government, local residents and businesses, NGOs, feminist activists and academics. What emerges here then is the complexity of articulations, agencies and constraints, all interrelated in producing particular discourses whereupon new forms of exclusion, power and civility emerge.

Chapter 4 explores feminism and "post-neoliberal" publics in Ecuador's constitutional reform. This chapter examines the shifting relationship of feminism to the "post-neoliberal" state, as feminist analyses have demonstrated that women's movements' engagement in state projects in Latin America often co-opt, de-politicise and institutionalise women's issues. This chapter argues for analytic attention to both the spaces inhabited and to the creation of new public spaces of social mobilisation: the former as "inviting" and the latter as "invented" spaces where (in this case) they may become marginalised and erased or even associated with "uncivil" criminalised behaviour.

Chapter 5 draws on the interesting topic of gossip as direct action and is based on an ethnography of a Zapatista solidarity collective based in Montreal, Canada. As one of the authors is directly involved in both the action and the research, as well as the spread of gossip, the methodology and the ethical considerations outlined in this chapter are well thought through, inspiring and a particularly useful framework for feminist research.

Chapter 6 is the concluding chapter; it extends the methodological, theoretical and pedagogical discussions in the previous chapters into reflecting on public scholarship, an anthropology of publics and public anthropology. The theorisation aims at developing new frameworks to study the emergence of new political spaces and new publics,

while the methodological parameters of feminist ethnography aimed at producing an ethnography of social action and activism. Interestingly, instead of answering questions, the authors suggest instead that initiating a critical pedagogy of public anthropology is what is required; consequently they end with a page and a half of questions in aiding the problematisation of the idea of the "public". It remains to be seen if future generations of feminist/activist/researchers will take up the challenge. For the time being, Contesting Publics is an exemplary start at addressing some of the issues involved in the democratisation of such contested terrain of publics, a project that desperately needs more feminist and ethnographic attention.

ANASTASIA CHRISTOU
Middlesex University (United Kingdom)

Navaro-Yashin, Yael. 2012. The Make-Believe Space. Affective Geography in a Postwar Polity. Durham and London: Duke University Press. xix + 270 pp. Pb.: $24.95. ISBN: 978082235204.

A very public and ethnographic anthropological account of the entanglements of materialities, division, and displacement in the affective experiences of Northern Cyprus and the lives of Turkish-Cypriots is what The Make-Believe Space is all about in its "phantasmatic" manifestation of life, objects and subjects of war and expropriation. The book examines the post-war social relations and political spaces of sociality and subjectivity in the aftermath of war and partition, of what the author, Yael Navaro-Yashin, conceptualises as contexts of "abjection", "ruination" and "phantasmatic" affective existence. This is a compelling and rich ethnography of nations, states, subjects, landscapes, objects, documents, ruins, spaces and places whereupon affective, material and imaginative geographies intersect with both ideologies and the banalities of everyday life in a divided island. This is a constellation of powerful geographies, illuminating anthropologies and potent publics, all unfolding in the contemporary, where both nations and states are salient features of lives, trajectories and polities.

There is a lot of human stuff circulating in the narrative excerpts of participants in this study and a great deal of profound insight into the messiness of the affective with the ordinary and the imposed in people's lives. It is the crafting of fantasy, lived and ethnographically deciphered intimacies of ruinations and the ramifications of what is left when war and displacement unfold in space, time and people's daily realities. Yael Navaro-Yashin combines excellent anthropological insight grounded on her reflexive understanding of Cyprus in spaces of friendship, kinship and intimacy that allows for a more holistic and attentive to relationality and subjectivity ethnography in a truthful realisation that the anthropological imagination is a product of the multidimensionality of the personal, the political and the professional. Marked by a decade of ethnographic immersion into the field from 1995 to 2005, Yashin offers a profoundly illuminating account of the messiness of daily human interaction crafted through fantasy, fact and policy.

The book is divided into three sections, all tackling different aspects of the "make-believe" space: spatial transformation, administration and objects and dwellings. The concept that Yashin introduces in this book, that of the "make-believe" space, is one that challenges the opposition between the social constructionist approaches and those of the new materialist perspective, thus, in term conceptualising the "phantasmatic" along with the tangible in unison thereby avoiding privileging either one. Very much a spatial and temporal investigation since both are intertwined in the aftermath of the 1974 partition of the island of Cyprus in defining its split territoriality beyond the material to the affective, social and political, an interrupted temporality emerges in 2003 after the opening of the checkpoints.

Narratives excerpts of Turkish-Cypriots are quite revealing of how the repopulated territory of Northern Cyprus figures in their everyday lives:

> This place belongs to the soldiers and to people from Turkey. Everything else exists only by chance. There is an extraordinary situation here, a state of emergency. If you were to worry every day about what happens here, you would lose the endurance to live here. If you live here, you have no choice but to accept the situation as it is. We, for example, have submitted ourselves. We have let ourselves be abased [under the presence of settlers and soldiers]. Otherwise they would not let us survive (Yilmaz, p. 56).

Such compromises, constructed as survival strategies within a consciousness of power entanglements, are a part of ordinary life. Nevertheless, settler communities are characterised by their heterogeneity in terms of their social, political and economic make-up. Grounding such differences of the Turkish-Cypriot polity ("Turkish Republic of Northern Cyprus" (TRNC)) is the fact that it is considered illegal under international law and hence, as an unrecognised state, it is particularly intriguing to observe a deeply affective attachment of the population to its civil service. Moreover, even more fascinating is the combination of feelings of apathy with a deep desire to acquire a civil service job. Prompted by an Agambian perspective, Yashin provides an insightful account of how the unrecognised state in northern Cyprus is inherently an amalgamation of sovereignty and biopolitics that evokes a particularity of a mixedness of affect. She exemplifies this through the study of objects such as documents among the most tangible phenomena that engender and enact political affects. As material manifestations of governance and law, documents are very much affectively charged, and they transmit energy as they transact a politics of affect that among other feelings, depict cosiness, cynicism, irony, familiarity, contempt and wit.

The affective relationship between people and surroundings of ruination is another layer of living among bordered ruins that Yashin tackles. In this sense, the abject both intrigues and repels but most importantly it is, in a Kristevian sense, located in the physical mechanisms of subjectivity and through which othering processes of self-identification emerge. A combination of inner and outer spaces of abjected domains is where identities are configured and defined. As Yashin suggests:

> drawing on Kristeva, we could construe the border area in Cyprus in such terms, not merely as an actual military blockade, but also as a spatial materiality that stands for that practice of abjection in the attempted constitution of a kind of subjective order in the aftermath of war. The abjected quality of the border. The border as an abjected space. The border area as the representation of that construed difference between the abject and the self (p. 148).

In other words, Yashin incorporates both a framework of selfhood and economy of violence in conceptualising abjection and thus proposes a visualisation of such in the light of both the personal and the socio-political representation of the system in a performative act of its materiality.

Such materialities, that is, the presence of objects or their actual absence, yield a sense of loss and hence spatial melancholia as the historical division of the island continues to the present. Having lost personal belongings and homes in southern Cyprus,

the sense of belonging and melancholia is accentuated by the realisation of a loss of a "sense of moral integrity". Decades of appropriation reinforce this spatial melancholy, which is essentially a feeling of a loss of self, the feeling of what Yashin considers "an abjectified self" in its interiority and exteriority, articulated through violence and war. This, ultimately, is what a make-believe space feels like; home and unhomely at the same time, imaginative and tangible, affective and abjectified, objectified and subjective: these are all make-believe qualities and practices that make it more than phantasmatic, as real as the barbed wire and bullet holes in brick and mortar, as vivid as the memories of the dead, identified or not, all a sense of self and identity in Cyprus.

ANASTASIA CHRISTOU
Middlesex University (United Kingdom)

Howes, David and Constance Classen. 2014. *Ways of Sensing. Understanding the Senses In Society*. London, New York: Routledge. 200 pp. Pb.: £62.00. ISBN: 9780415697156.

At first glance, the volume *Ways of Sensing* authored by David Howes and Constance Classen, two of the leading scholars in the emerging field of sensory ethnography, may be understood as a condensed and updated version of the 400-page milestone volume *Empire of Senses - The Sensual Culture Reader* edited by David Howes. In 2005, *Empire of the Senses* overturned the linguistic and textual models of anthropological interpretation and placed sensory experience at the forefront of cultural analysis. The new volume does much more than this: through the contribution of Constance Classen, it extends not only the rich list of literature of the anthropology of senses but instead shifts the emphasis to the history and historicity of senses, focusing on the transformability of sensory orders and perceptions over time and cultures. The volume proposes a joint anthropological-historical methodology to study the senses, both within specific societies and cultures and cross-culturally.

Classen favours a historical approach to the senses, one grounded on the seminal research of the French historian Alain Corbin (1994). She argues that the sensual properties and the perception of historical events can be "reconstructed" and that this will lead us to a better understanding of the social underpinnings and reactions towards particular historical events. With this, she directs out attention to the immanent links between the senses, politics, ideologies and hierarchies of power. Sensory experience and emotions do not exist independently from politics but are interwoven with it; this is why the authors see the "politics of the senses" as a pivotal concept that has prominently shaped our sensual perception over centuries.

The volume presents a rich panorama of prominent settings in which senses do play a prominent role in societies of the past and the present: art perception, sensuous healing, sensory and social ordering, synaesthesia, perceptions of justice, and the use of senses for marketing purposes. In particular, the last two topics are innovative and welcome contributions to the dynamic and emerging field of sensory studies. The idea to link the senses with issues of law seems to be a particularly new and innovative step; indeed, we take for granted that audio-visual evidence is preferred in comparison to other sensory evidence in courts of justice. Moreover, the visual and aural characteristics of the courtroom are familiar to us but have not once been questioned thus far. The book asks for the (historical) reasons behind this and additionally presents various sensory representations/personifications of justice throughout history: from the Roman goddess "Justitia" to the representation of lawyers in Charles Dickens' work – a well informed and highly diverting chapter of the book.

The use of the senses for commercial purposes is another significant addition to recent studies on the human senses. Howes and Classen explain compellingly through rich examples that the new ideal of an "experience economy" require a stronger engagement of the senses in the realm of publicity than ever before, although the marketing of sensations reaches back into the 18th century.

Throughout the volume, the authors of the book refuse a strict division between cognitive and sensory experience. Instead, Howes and Classen consider sensory impressions as fertile ground for ideas and cognitive values. The resulting question touches upon the aesthetic and social relevance of the senses: 'To what extent, however, can the senses of touch, taste and smell model and transmit cultural values?' (p. 3) Naturally, this question implies a discussion of sensory representations in art history as the cover image of the volume implies. This discussion is probably the least convincing part of the volume. The statement that "art in the modern world is overwhelmingly visual" is rather debatable and the description of a combined sensory perception of art as a largely historical phenomenon at least in the Western Hemisphere is misleading. The Fluxus movement of the 1960s and artists like Dorothy Iannone who combined image, text, film and sounds in highly complex installations foreshadowed the growing popularity of multisensory art in our times. The audiences of the 21st century are far from a "single-sensed understanding of art" that the authors claim; instead artists and audiences engage more and more in artworks that challenge and engage our senses more complexly. At the same time, museum exhibits today do not 'remain predominantly silent, visual spectacles' (p. 29); instead, multisensory forms of exhibiting have gained ground on the way to what the authors themselves describe as the future "multimedia museum". This fundamental detachment from the 19th century perception of art are not just "cracks in the visualist façade" but instead a fundamental and paradigmatic change.

The book has two other shortcomings: firstly, it does not explore the class-relatedness of sensory access and perception, although this topic shines through in certain passages of the volume. Secondly, the authors leave largely unexplored the crucial concept of "taste". Sensory marketing, for example, has always been directed and shaped in reference to different "taste publics" – but Howes and Classen seem to avoid here terminological discussions with terms which compete with their favoured "anthropology of senses".

With this book, the on-going discussion of the individuality and universality of sensory perception and the legitimacy of a phenomenological perspective of the senses between Tim Ingold (2000), Sarah Pink and David Howes will surely receive a fresh impetus. It adds a retrospective perspective to the study of the senses, making us aware of the alterable role senses have played as driving forces throughout human history.

ECKEHARD PISTRICK
Martin-Luther-University Halle-Wittenberg (Germany)

Halilovich, Hariz (2013). ***Places of Pain. Forced Displacement, Popular Memory and Trans-local Identities in Bosnian War-torn Communities*****. New York, Oxford: Berghahn Books. xviii + 269 pp. Hb.: $95.00/£60.00. ISBN: 9780857457769.**

The author intended this book to be a homage to and celebration of multicultural Bosnia, or the ideal of such a Bosnia, which now, ironically, exists only outside of Bosnia in the war-torn communities of the Bosnian diaspora throughout the world. This book is actually the largest study of displaced Bosnians to date and provides a deeper understanding of reality of displacement and post-war Bosnian identity and memory. Researching the global Bosnian diaspora (Austria, Australia, Sweden, U.S.A.) was a methodologically very difficult undertaking, so the author brilliantly combines narrative analysis 'with Geertzian thick description and ethnographic vignettes from the sites, places, networks and events that constitute the diaspora' (p. 7). Memories and narratives of displacement are not (re) collected in a coherent, (chrono)logical order, and they are mostly made up of fragments that the author connects and supplement with his own observations and participation. The key themes – places, memories and identities – are observed as 'experiential and performative actions that are situational, relational and self-perpetuating' (p. 7). Studying displaced Bosnians, the author did not neglect war-torn communities within Bosnia and Herzegovina, thus giving a broad new perspective on researching these communities. He explores monuments, memorials and commemorations and their relation to both personal and collective memories. At the end of the book, he explores the magnitude of the crimes against women, officially and unofficially remembered, as well as how it has affected the memories and identities of women survivors, their families and communities.

Theoretically, the author avoids being pulled into either of major theoretical frameworks and debates around displacement and identity (sedentarist and anti-sedentarist). He argues that, in practice, this dichotomy 'seems to be more important and meaningful to academics than to (dis)placed people: as my research findings and personal experience suggest, regardless of the level of their (im)mobility, people can develop and maintain multiple attachments to different places as well as construct their identities in the absence of an actual place' (p. 9). He argues that a 'predominantly transnational conceptual framework needs to be expanded to include trans-local diasporic identity formation among displaced Bosnians around the globe' (p. 118). By avoiding the term transnationalism, the author circumvents some of the limitations of that term, and focuses on trans-localism that has recently been regarded as a key focus of study in international migration. Bosnian-performed trans-localism exemplifies how cultural place and embodied local identities transcend geographical space and chronological time and how mobility and attachment to place are not intrinsically contradictory processes. According to Halilovich:

> trans-localism confirms the dynamism and fluidity of the complex relationship in which the identity of place as a set of embodied practices transcends its original geographical location and becomes polylocal, or trans-local. Hence, trans-localism encompasses a wide spectrum of practices and relationship

> as the articulation of distinct (trans-)local identities and reveals how these practices and relationships get reconstructed, readjusted, remembered and reimagined in the world of movement (p.152).

The book describes how groups from Bosnia follow the patterns that are local (*zavičaj*) based, rather than national, ethnic or religious. The term *zavičaj* is defined by 'local geography, cultural norms, dialect, kinship, neighbourliness, a common way of life and embodied relationship with the place and social networks' (p. 10). This term encompass the wholeness of person-in-place and place-in-person and represents a social glue based on family background, kinship, friendship, dialect and place of origin and is, according to Halilovich, an extremely powerful cohesive factor in diaspora. *Zavičaj* both reflects and contributes to the multicultural and multi-ethnic pattern of life, and for those whose identity is embodied in the idea of the *zavičaj*, it continues to exist as an experiential reality 'despite its physical destruction and forced displacement' (p. 11).

The "dark side" of the book and extremely emotionally disturbing, especially to a person who lived through something similar, are the author's personal experiences and individual stories of his informants described in an almost artistic manner. For example, presenting three individual stories of displaced Bosnians in Austria (Sejo, Edita and Ibro), Halilovich among other things describes Edita's pre-war life and her father Alija who was a local postman: 'He loved his job, riding on his motorbike between villages and from house to house, exchanging the news and making many friends. He was popular and respected for his reliability, honesty and good sense of humor. He was always ready to crack a joke without insulting anyone. It seemed that everyone loved "Postman Ale", as they fondly called him.'

Edita and her brother Fikret especially loved him and were immensely proud of their dad. He would put them on his motorbike, and they would hold onto him tightly while riding around, feeling excited and safe behind his back' (p. 63). Later, Alija was killed by armed Serbian forces and Edita lost everything overnight.

Participating at one conference in Sarajevo, Halilovich, with other participants, was taken to a mass grave site near Potočari (Srebrenica), and he describes his experience:

> We could see some dozen skulls and many human bones scattered in the mud at the bottom of the pit. There were also pieces of clothing and shoes mixed with the body parts. Against the backdrop of visitors more befitting a school excursion, I was suddenly overcome with discomfort and a sense of shame for being where I was. It was not the direct confrontation with the magnitude of the tragedy called 'Srebrenica', or the realization of what human beings were able to do to each other that overwhelmed me. Rather, I felt ashamed for being a spectator, for looking at the exposed victims` skulls and femurs still covered in mud. I and others felt massive presence at the site was posthumously robbing the victims of their dignity. There they were, lying, still nameless, dismembered, their bones crushed, each piece of the remains holding clues to the secret of the way these people had died in July 1995 (pp. 94–95).

The part that seems somewhat problematic is Halilovich's choice of informants, at least those presented in the book. Most of his informants are actually Bosniaks or Muslims. I realise that it was easier for him to approach these informants since, as he wrote himself, Croats and Serbs "recognized" him as a member of the "Other" community and were not so open to his questions. However, since most of his materials are based on a decidedly distinct group, the question is: can we discuss Bosnian war-torn communities without taking in consideration, for example, Bosnian Croats now living in Croatia, or Bosnian Serb now living in Serbia where utopia of *zavičaj*, as described by Halilovich, is not functioning?

Nevertheless, this book is a brilliantly written, theoretically and methodologically refreshing and pioneering work in the studies of Bosnian diaspora. It often makes one laugh at one moment and in the next brings one to the brink of tears. Therefore, this reviewer does not recommend reading it before going to sleep.

MARIO KATIĆ
University of Zadar (Croatia)

Sheller, Mimi. 2012. *Citizenship from Below: Erotic Agency and Caribbean Freedom*. Durham and London: Duke University Press. xviii + 346 pp. Pb.: $25.95. ISBN: 9780822349532.

In this book, Sheller so powerfully challenges narrow thinking about freedom that it would certainly influence scholars across disciplines to think "differently" and to think "together" of citizenship, erotic agency and human dignity as fundamentally "embodied phenomenon". The book consists of an introduction and nine chapters, of which the last brings the theoretical discussion on erotic agency and a queer Caribbean freedom to a new level. Sheller applies a novel approach to archival material, literature and textual sources, including poetry. She addresses methodological challenges of using such sources by 'listening to the bass notes' (p. 113) in archival material and using her sharp-eye to trace material evidences and absences in archival photography. Sheller argues that gender and sexuality was central to slavery, and it is crucial to understand these historical sensitivities in order to understand the post-slavery citizenship and embodied freedom.

In Chapter 1, Sheller discusses "citizenship from below" through examining the voices of subaltern groups, labour and sexual histories towards theoretical advancement of "embodied freedom", which she continues to saturate throughout the book. By interlinking concepts related to citizenship, embodiment, sexuality and erotic subjectivity, she lays out the framework of how we can analytically capture "citizenship from below" through both performative and discoursive inter-embodiments of gazes, gestures, voices, pauses, movements and encounters.

In the following two chapters, Sheller probes deeper into gender formations and relations between marginalised groups, almost always overlooked in archival sources, which represent the perspective of the ruling class. However, Sheller's detailed reading proves that proud, independent, black slave women also held positions of relative power, resisted slavery and reclaimed their bodies either by running away, by taking their own time or dedicating themselves to motherhood. She elucidates ways through which Afro-Jamaican women claimed gendered rights and how they actually enacted embodied freedom from below.

Chapter 4 is an exemplary work of an excellent interpretation of archival photography. Sheller pierces through what is visible and interprets details of a materiality of embodied freedom – bare feet, tired eyes and labouring bodies speak of hard life from one set of photography of black people – while there is a total absence of bare feet in elite photography.

In Chapter 5, Sheller argues how and why the militarisation of masculinity undermined revolutionary promises of freedom, and she warns against romanticising all forms of "citizenship from below" *per se*, as these Caribbean "sword-bearing citizens" were carrying danger for women and children especially. In the following chapter, she excavates voices and practices within historiographical silences and accounts for relevant evidences how free urban women of colour exercised their agency in small-scale trade as well as in sexual-economic exchange. She argues that it was the very existence of this gendered citizenship from below – the financially free women – that led to the revision of Haitian civil law in the mid-19th century that granted considerable financial independence to married women.

Chapter 7 is, literally, about rooted structures for citizenship from below both in terms of its content and method: the author takes physical environment as a ground to broaden thinking about co-existing corporeality in time and space. Embodiment, she argues, means also interactions of humans with trees, gardens and land-plots. By combining approaches from anthropology and cultural geography, the author deepens interpretations of local meanings of nature and its interrelated immaterial realm of sacred places, the symbolism of slender palm trees, which need to be protected and thick *mapou* or silk cotton trees, which are both real shelter and meeting spots where Caribbean freedom was forged.

Chapter 8 analyses how Caribbean bodies (and body parts, facial features) were objectivised and exoticised in colonial travel writing. Sheller incorporates here analysis of literature and poetry and demonstrates how valuable these sources are for historiography to trace subaltern histories. She skilfully maps out what these texts fail to describe, what are fault lines that disrupt tourist gaze", notices counter-gazes, interprets "staring" and "laughing" of Caribbean people, which a white colonial traveller disinclined to see from his/her taken-for-granted racial superiority position.

In Chapter 9, Sheller provides a historically grounded analysis of sexual mobilisation and adds aesthetic and artistic aspects of erotic in completing the concept of "erotic agency". Erotic is energy for social change, erotic encompass a wider realm of feelings and sensual, 'erotic agency, in sum, is the anti-thesis of enslavement' (p. 245).

To conclude, this reviewer wants to highlight the lasting legacy, she believes, this book will have for those willing to understand embodiment, freedom and erotic agency in a broad sense. Sheller has opened a new study field in which erotic agency and sexual citizenship are "central" to understand embodied freedom. This is a radical revision of still widespread categorical distinction between sexuality and politics. Sheller argues that sexual citizenship is "always" about relationships between bodies and governments, and sexuality and citizenship should be thought as corpo-reality in everyday practice in which inter-bodily relations are a fundamental basis for dignity and empowerment, individually and collectively.

Once again, this reviewer praises the author and encourages others to follow her examples in advancing methodologies in studying photography, poetry and performances to trace "voices" and fleeting materiality of subaltern groups in examining meanings of embodied freedom and erotic agency. The chapter (7) about human relations with trees, implicated with erotic as 'the larger life horizon in which existence flourishes' (p. 279) was particularly appealing to this reviewer as a (more) geographical reading of erotic agency and freedom as spatial, temporal and corporeal.

This is a ground-breaking interdisciplinary achievement and contribution to the theory of freedom; thus, it is difficult to do justice to this rich and theoretically dense book. It certainly deserves more reviews from the regional perspective as well as from academics in feminist and queer studies and those who use archival material innovatively in historical sociology and other disciplines.

AIJA LULLE
University of Latvia (Latvia)

Collier, Stephen J. 2011. *Post-Soviet Social: Neoliberalism, Social Modernity, Biopolitics*. Princeton: Princeton University Press. 320 pp. Pb.: $26.95 / £18.95. ISBN: 9780691148311.

According to Stephen Collier, a generation of critics has unsatisfactorily articulated the relationship between neoliberalism and social modernity. In the familiar discourses, "neoliberalism" stands for a political-economic project, hostile to forms of social protection through its focus on the marketisation of society and the offensive against the social state. Collier's book goes beyond this dominant discourse. Methodologically informed by Michel Foucault's 1970s lectures on biopolitics and liberalism, the book puts forth a provocative argument by examining the making of Soviet social modernity and neoliberal reform in post-Soviet Russia.

In the first part of the book, Collier provides a genealogy of Soviet social modernity by focusing on Soviet city-building. In Chapter 2, he begins by looking at the three formations of government (absolutist-disciplinary, sovereignist-developmental and Soviet biopolitical-disciplinary) (p. 41) and argues that in contrast to the tsarist regime, which was hindering the transformation of collective life related to industrial development, 'Soviet state-led industrialization was accompanied by explicit efforts to revolutionize the national population's conditions of existence, first of all by rearranging it over national space' (p. 49). Collier shows how the Soviet planning debates played out with the division between genetic and teleological planning. Teleological planning, which rejected the idea that an autonomous sphere could impose limits on state activity, prevailed and inserted itself into total planning, shaping a distinct biopolitical form of government, dismissing the limitations and the autonomous laws, which we find in the political ontology of liberalism.

In the following chapter, Collier expands the previous chapter by looking at city-building from the perspective of total planning. He provides a comparison between the Soviet and the liberal project of social modernity in terms of two key concepts of liberal social modernity – population and norm, both of which were re-worked in the Soviet case, as the population emerges as labour-power and as subjects of need, while norms in Soviet city-building are prescriptive (p. 67).

In Chapters 4 and 5, Collier takes the industrial cities of Belaya Kalitva and Rodniki as case studies of city-building, arguing that 'city-building provides a window on the process through which a new kind of collectivity was assembled in Soviet cities, as urban populations were linked together and plugged into a new substantive economy' (p. 85). By the end of the final part, it is pointed out how the city is de-governmentalised, yet as Collier points out, 'What the "degovernmentalization" of the city of city-building does *not* imply is that the elements that comprised the material, spatial, and demographic reality of cities built according to the city-building ideal simply vanished, either as material realities or as governmental problems'(p. 124).

In the second part of the book, the author turns to neoliberal reform. His meticulous examination presents to the reader a decidedly different image of how neoliberal reform actually worked in the case of post-Soviet Russia. Thus, in Chapter 6, he begins the analysis

by looking at structural adjustment. There certainly is a part of Collier's work here that takes up the traditional way of understanding neoliberal reform: for instance, his narration of the 1990s project of liberalisation, privatisation and stabilisation. Thus, the author does not renounce in entirety the argument that neoliberal reform is also about attempts at marketising society. However, for Collier this phase occupies only a short period of time, after which some of these questions were profoundly reconfigured, and 'the substance of reforms shifted' (p. 134). According to the author, rather than following a prescribed set of policies, which are put into practice, the implementation of neoliberal reform was based on conjunctural factors, and he identifies structural adjustment as an initial attempt to deal with the economic crisis, rather than a project of ideological offensive. In the following two chapters, he shows how the focus of reform shifts from the parameters of the "Washington consensus" towards reforming elements of Soviet social modernity, such as the budget (Chapter 7) and centralised heating systems (Chapter 8). In terms of budget reform, the author presents both ethnographic material and relates budget reforms to James Buchanan's minor tradition of fiscal theory, a current of neoliberal thought that did not reject the social state, but rather aimed to reconcile its existence with the tenets of classical liberal thought. In the chapter on the reform of centralised heating systems, the author continues in the same vein, dispelling once again the myth that neoliberal reform necessarily corresponds to an ideologically-driven dismantlement of public services. For Collier, reforms in post-Soviet Russia worked through the deployment of *microeconomic devices*, which 'depend on formal mechanisms of free choice, calculation, and enterprise. However, their aggregate functioning does not add up to a market, in which allocations are driven by mechanisms of supply and demand' (p. 242). In other words, reform has to work within the stubborn material framework, inherited from Soviet modernity. This difficult framework prevents centralised heating systems from being simply privatised. Rather, reforms 'retain the basic proposition that heat meets an essential need and that its provision has, at the end of the day, to be guaranteed by government' (p. 207).

In the epilogue of the book, the author returns to the initial question of neoliberalism and dissatisfaction with the predominant discourse. However, besides its critical tone, the epilogue is also extremely productive, as it offers a methodological toolbox: useful strategies for studying neoliberalism beyond the usual assumptions.

Undoubtedly, Collier's book is complex, yet highly rewarding, and this reviewer is certain that this book will transform not only our perception of how neoliberal reform actually worked in places like post-Soviet Russia, but also how we approach neoliberalism as an object of anthropological inquiry.

VALTER CVIJIĆ
Scientific Research Centre SAZU (Slovenia)

Billé, Franck, Grégory Delaplace and Caroline Humphrey (eds.). 2012. *Frontier Encounters. Knowledge and Practice at the Russian, Chinese and Mongolian Border*. Cambridge: Open Book Publishers. xii + 278 pp. Pb.: £15.95. ISBN: 9781906924874.

There are few better places than a border to explore remarkably dissimilar ways of development, the rule of law, citizen rights, migration and inequality. The border is where cultural differences and divergent political strategies become evident, as well as the space where new partnerships are developing. Moreover, borders are deeply embedded in societies and encompass an arranging quality and enduring significance even in a context of globalisation. This conceptual "thickness" of borderlands is particularly well reflected in the volume *Frontier Encounters. Knowledge and Practice at the Russian, Chinese and Mongolian Border*, confirming once again that frontiers are not just lines drawn on maps and territorial demarcations, but also embodied imageries, social infrastructures and political mechanisms.

Nowadays, we observe how some borders are becoming more fluid and others more fixed. The meaning of borders is thus shifting, but not necessarily disappearing. There is, for instance, a certain decline of defining the borders as barriers of movement, paralleled by a development of borders as "managers" of flows. We see how people, goods, capital, information and even ideas and tragedies are moving faster and crossing (old) boundaries in a more irrespective way. This has three practical consequences: 1) We seem to be less cautious when crossing borders. 2) State power feels increasingly challenged, and thus develops new apparatuses of surveillance. 3) Relations and separations across borders are reshaped, influencing what individuals consider "normal".

It is thus not surprising that the study of borders is increasing in relevance. Not just the study of borders, but more precisely the normality and everydayness of living at the edge. A border is simultaneously distanced from political centres and immersed in transnational circulations. Indeed, borderlands are places where transnational culture takes place, yet not standardised but in a dialectic form (as the outcome of tensions and attentions). Anthropologists themselves frequently cross international and regional borders in order to do fieldwork. They are, therefore, well aware of some of the features that borders present. If we add to this the questions about access and scale that globalization posits, and the outgoing interest in matters related to identity, we determine from where this increasing attention is coming.

Focusing on a precise yet rich case study, *Frontier Encounters* sets up an original frame of understanding as well as a wide range of views on how these borders are built, conceived and enacted. Likewise, this compilation challenges a tendency in anthropological research to frame analysis merely in terms of culture and identity. For instance, some of the contributors have reflected upon what kind of normality the presence of a border constitutes; whilst some others focus on the processes of crossing and surveilling. Overall, *Frontier Encounters* is an anthology of how a point of passage works as a condensation of history (Delaplace) and infrastructures (Batomunkuev); as a meeting device for individuals (Billé), civilizations (Humphrey), traditions (Bulag), smuggling

(Namsaraeva), political repressions (Baldano, Peshkov) and survival tactics (Ryzhova, Anthony); and as a regulator of migration (Dyatlov), trade and labour (Lacaze).

The volume combines two relevant approaches in the (emerging) field of the anthropology of borders, namely the study of how people live in border regions and the (multiple) ways in which (singular) borders are conceived. In this sense, Delaplace presents the border as a complicated door (pp. 4–5). Borders not only discriminate between people, they also impose conditions on those who are allowed to cross them. They are not open to everybody, and not to everybody on the same conditions. Borders look different depending on who you are and where you come from (pp. 12). Hence, and agreeing with the editors of the volume, it would be more precise to pay attention to 'specific regimes of openness' (pp. 13), rather than talking about borders as closed or open.

The border epitomises the interrelations between individuals, groups of people and states, becoming a crossroad of institutions, contacts, conflicts and interests (see Baldano). Russia's Far Eastern provinces are a good example of this, wherein its inhabitants combine feelings of abandonment and stagnation with perceptions of a bursting China hungry for land – this fear and anxiety being symptomatically exaggerated (see Dyatlov). Symptomatically, because it relates with the conception of Russia and its historical evolution, through the Tsarist empire, the USSR, and the Russian Federation, eventually impacting how the border has been treated by the state as well as to the notion of frontier itself (pp. 55–56).

Humphrey finds the distinct character of the Russian-Chinese border in a centuries-old frontier of two post-imperial states (with markedly different cultures), which hosts indigenous people, such as Buryats and Evenki (communities that belong to the respective "large civilizations" only by a process of incomplete incorporation). This border was indeed created in the seventeenth century by Russia and Manchu China, and not by local ethnic groups, which in many cases have more in common with their fellows across the border. Likewise, mass migration, mostly promoted by Russia's inner dynamics, transformed the region's ethnic situation (see Peshkov). As a result, it determined the fate of local communities and even their understanding of "home" (see Namsaraeva).

Borderlands entail not only an emotional quality but also a conceptual tension between "border" and "frontier". For instance, Chinese lexical wealth suggests a wider set of spatially overlapping concepts, whilst, in Russian, "border" tends to be conceptualized as a firm line. Consequently, Chinese perceptions tend to be more zonal, frontier-like (see Billé). Borders and frontiers coexist, rather than being mutually exclusive. For instance, Humphrey remarks how the exiled Cossacks have become, through acculturation and intermarriage with other local groups, peoples who belong to the borderland. Different communities produce qualitatively different conceptions of space and time, and the way borders are perceived and imagined is crucial for that. Even boundaries with different neighbours are likely to be conceived differently (see Delaplace). Furthermore, after studying how hunters illegally cross the border, Anthony argues in his contribution that the very line can be practised as both multiple and singular. In his view, the hunter is not so much crossing and abstract line as he is immersed within a landscape in which the risks of animals, weather, border patrols and the like are all serious elements with which the

hunter has to engage. Simultaneously, he has to make estimations as to where the precise location of the border is, thereby actualising it (pp. 204–206).

In the aftermath of the Soviet collapse, scholarship on Central Asia has significantly increased, probably driven by post-colonial paradigms, geostrategic interests (war, natural resources, uprising of China, etc.), anthropological relevance, and a previous lack of access to the region to international researchers. By examining interactions between China, Mongolia and Russia at the passages where these nations meet, as well as on the immense borderland that separates them, this volume provides fresh material to a field of research still dominated by studies of the United States and Mexico border. The only critique this reviewer might raise is that the quality among the chapters is rather unequal.

FRANCISCO MARTÍNEZ
University of Tallinn (Estonia)

Miller, Daniel and Sophie Woodward. 2012. *Blue Jeans: The Art of the Ordinary. Berkeley, Los Angeles, London: University of California Press.* 169 pp. Pb.: £16.95. ISBN: 9780520272194.

In their book, Miller and Woodward expand our comprehension of the contemporary wearing of blue jeans by asking a simple question: Why do so many people wear them? Although blue jeans dominate most people's everyday wardrobe, there is remarkably little written about this topic, while famous designers whose clothes cannot even be seen on the streets receive enormous coverage. In the development of their arguments, the authors move beyond the historical research of blue jeans, claiming that today there are many products with deep historical trajectories that cannot be compared with the popularity and wide spread of blue jeans. The authors also realise that global presence of some items cannot be explained by the argument that capitalism persuades people to adopt the products that best serve the maximisation of profit. At the same time, they provide an insightful argument that firms would make much more money producing and selling clothes that rapidly go out of fashion.

The authors turned their research perspective to the ethnography of wearing jeans by studying people's life stories through the use of jeans and directing their broad research towards people's work, personal issues, feelings and relationships in the family sphere. Their fieldwork renders it obvious that in studying material culture the anthropological method of participating observation can provide deeply insightful knowledge, since the researcher derives no conclusions from presumptions and hypotheses established in advance, but must execute the research without an explanation given in advance. The researcher must remain open to the unknown instead of following a predetermined outline of questions that imply conclusions even before the end of the research.

Miller and Woodward make a unique and insightful contribution to material studies by questioning well-known assumptions that fashion is a fast, constantly changing phenomenon, based on "top-down" theories of theoreticians such as Veblen and Simmel, or "bottom-up" theories, that, for example, Hebdige represents. While carrying out ethnographic fieldwork, the authors realise that people do not strive for constant innovation in wearing jeans. In fact, as people's lives are permeated with massive advertising and fashion industries, they feel distant from these imperatives. People choose their jeans, not on the basis of brands and fashion dictates, but on the assumption of how they fit with their personality and individuality, which they describe in terms of 'comfort' and 'fit' (p. 64) wherein 'comfort is far more than just the feel of a fabric, as this physical experience also encodes a sense of what seems suitable or appropriate for a particular person' (p. 65). The authors expand their argument by stating that it does not matter how well jeans fit on the body, but how they look on the individual. Besides the amount of time jeans are worn, it is from this that the feeling of comfort is derived.

Studying blue jeans, the authors realise that people actually strive to become more ordinary. Far from being limited to these topics, the authors offer an eclectic understanding of the term 'ordinary' through further exploration of the concept of ordinary in their in-depth ethnographic fieldwork. The book attempts to demonstrate that 'jeans are approaching a post-semiotic status' (p. 95), which does not mean we are witnessing a total massive generalisation, since there are still people who buy designer jeans, but while

focusing on the observation that the majority of people on the streets do not wear or own designer jeans, blue jeans certainly are ubiquitous.

Moreover, in the context of the ordinary, jeans also serve as a 'default mode for simply getting dressed and out of the house in the morning' (p. 95), they represent an easy choice for people when they do not know what to wear, and they help to overcome social pressures and personal insecurities. With all these features 'jeans can accomplish an external task, an experience tantamount to a loss of self-consciousness' (p. 98). People were asked if blue jeans could go with any other colour or fabric and they replied in the negative, which leads us to think that the notion of denim blue jeans being compatible with other garments cannot be derived from their property, although informants think their quality of fitting with everything else lies in their intrinsic property. Only when 'blue jeans become nothing in themselves, they can go with anything' (p. 99).

The authors carried out their study in London, home for many migrants who are happy to reject the identity of the place where they were born and do not want to have a new identity while living in London as Londoners. They embrace the notion of being 'no one in particular' (p. 117) and jeans are perfect for that since they carry a connotation of sameness. 'The post-semiotic property of jeans lends itself to the ideal of post-identity of identification' (p. 119) or as one of the informants from Brazil stated: 'If I wanted to be fucking Brazilian I would have stayed in fucking Brazil' (Miller 2008, p. 134). Wearing ordinary and proper jeans, people feel better in public, and through the feeling of being ordinary they can feel more equal and included; however, this does not mean that class, gender and income distinctions no longer exist: it simply indicates that wearing jeans as an expression of being ordinary allows people to elude categorisations.

Further exploring the relationship between the normative and ordinary, the authors conclude that the ordinary stands in opposition to the normative, since the social normative tends to put pressure on people to wear something distinctive and to represent a particular kind of identity. In this way, the authors distance themselves from Goffman's argument that the ordinary allows categorisation of other people in a sense that a particular dressing style denotes a particular behaviour of the person. While further developing and exploring the term ordinary, the authors come closer to the arguments of researchers such as Savage and Longhurst, who realised that wearing blue jeans provides the concept of inclusion to people since everyone can wear them regardless of their taste, income and background.

The authors are well aware that there are hardly any generalisations possible, and they realise that the concept of ordinary would probably not be as urgent anywhere else as in such a multicultural and highly diverse city as London, so the meaning of wearing blue jeans might be entirely different in other parts of the world. Given the global presence of blue jeans, the topic was too vast; so, the authors established a Global Denim project to encourage other researchers all over the world to provide their ideas and research observations. One could argue that the tendency of further research of blue jeans to provide a unique solution is what makes their theory so illuminating and distinct from other contemporary research. They offer a more engaging approach to interpreting contemporary society in a most illuminating scientific discussion on examining specific local cultural forms and at the same time their ubiquity across the world.

POLONA SITAR
Scientific Research Centre SAZU (Slovenia)

Ateljevic, Irena, Nigel Morgan and Annette Pritchard (eds.) 2012. *The Critical Turn in Tourism Studies: Creating an Academy of Hope (Routledge Advances in Tourism)* London, New York: Routledge. xl + 234 pp. Hb.: £95.00 ISBN: 9780415585521.

The Critical Turn in Tourism Studies is a continuation of the previously published volume (2007), entitled *The Critical Turn in Tourism Studies: Innovative Research Methodologies*. Both books from the series are a result of the project that was started by the respective editors. In the narrowest sense of the word, the editors consider the idea of hopeful tourism as an aspect of the "academy of hope", hence the subtitle of the book, *Creating the Academy of Hope*. In creating the concept, the editors found inspiration in Bell Hook's work (2003), i.e. in her notion "pedagogy of hope". Under the notion "academy of hope", the editors imply the "new school of thought" by which they plan to introduce a new methodology and practice in tourism studies. The stated purpose of this book is to present the recent "thinking around hopeful tourism". The concept "hopeful tourism" is presented as a new a values-led, humanist perspective in tourism studies, driven by the desire to replace now obsolete theses and perspectives in tourism studies. The volume gathers scholars who advocate reinterpretation and critical approaches to the study of tourism at a time when we are faced with new perspectives that are emerging across many disciplines and research fields. In this context, the book's editors bring together a wide range of studies from different European countries, from Scandinavia to the Mediterranean, and other countries (Israel, New Zealand, USA, Canada). Similar to the first volume in the series, the authors and the topics presented in the book offer a variety of analytical positions, whereas the book as a whole offers a breadth of disciplinary and international perspectives. Since the publication of *The Tourist Gaze* (Urry 1990), which marked a significant turning point in tourism studies, many analysts have begun to shift their attention towards the social and cultural relations of power in tourism. We could say the authors of the papers in this edition again bring a breath of fresh air to tourism studies, moving away from the orthodox and dominant ways of thinking, and creating and disseminating new knowledge of the tourism phenomenon. This is achieved by pushing the field's boundaries, thus helping us see the subject matter anew. It is no exaggeration to say that the authors propose and start a paradigm shift. Those who pick up the book will find that the authors have been successful in doing so, given the fact that from the very beginning of the project until today a wide network has been established of experts and like-minded individuals advocating a complete turn in tourism studies. Among other things, with this volume the editors and authors appeal to intellectuals to cope with all the challenges that lie ahead in the effort of creating "a just and sustainable planet". The idea of tourism solely as an economic practice is no longer sustainable. We need to re-evaluate and rethink this traditional concept, assert the authors, because that is our only hope if we are to survive, and also ensure the survival of our planet for future generations. The editors hope that their concept of hopeful tourism will serve as a starting point for creating a "new hope" that shall encourage and challenge researchers and educators to abandon obsolete ideas and start thinking of tourism as an ethical, political and ultimately a civilisational project.

The book is intended primarily for students of graduate level studies, as well as young researchers at the beginning of their careers who are facing the issue of how to make plans for their future, but also to readers interested in the future of our planet and the environment.

The volume includes fourteen papers written by 23 authors and co-authors, an extensive foreword, an introduction and an epilogue: a total of 234 pages. With this in mind the editors have organised the volume in three parts: "Critical tourism research" (containing four papers), "Critical tourism education" (containing five papers), and "Critical action in the 'tourism world'" (also five papers). Each part has a short introduction written by one of the editors. Within the first section, we find studies that have focused on the conceptual developments and innovative methodologies in tourism research. They include new ways of doing field research in tourism, which neccessarily means a rethinking of our emotions when in the field; thus, concepts like emotionality and reflexivity are being revisited. This reviewer would like to point out two papers by N. Ali and C. Noy, who reflect on their own experience and emotions while conducting research in environments they consider their own (Pakistan and Israel respectively).

In the second part, the authors, to a greater or lesser extent, show the different roles that teachers have in transmitting ethical ideas, consciousness and responsibility to students, while exploring their experiences in tourism, all the while pointing out that past views on tourism are no more sustainable. The authors emphasise the necessity of teachers' involvement in changing ideas about tourism.

In the third part, the papers mostly deal with alternative economies in tourism via engaging case-studies, accompanied by examples, from different European (Bosnia and Herzegovina, Denmark, Turkey, and the Netherlands) and non-European countries (Argentina, Israel).

In their concluding thoughts, the authors offer stimulating new views on tourism, new methodologies, as well as engaging empirical examples of new practices. The editors also envision different scenarios of future developments in tourism studies as we are faced with a new transmodern era in which we need to reconsider our environmental, social, cultural, and economic politics. The timing of the book as well as the subject and the problem it raises, as the editors emphasise, could not be better. Those who take on this book do need to have a certain degree of previous knowledge to be able to follow and understand the ideas and discussions offered.

DANIELA BIRT KATIĆ
University of Zadar (Croatia)

Auyero, Javier. 2012. *Patients of the State: The Politics of Waiting in Argentina.* Durham and London: Duke University Press. xii + 196 pp. Pb.: $22.95. ISBN: 9780822352334

Waiting, as a process, a subjective experience and a site of the production of dependence and inequality, holds a central place in Javier Auyero's descriptions of the daily life of the urban poor in Argentina's capital of Buenos Aires. He understands acts of waiting 'as temporal processes in and through which political subordination is reproduced' (p. 2). This book is about the subjective experience of waiting and about dealing of the urban poor with state bureaucracies in which they 'have to *patiently comply with* the seemingly arbitrary, ambiguous, and always changing state requirements' (p. 9, emphasis in original), as well as about the political consequences of this patient complying.

Through the combination of ethnographic vignettes and statistical and demographic data from the metropolitan Buenos Aires, Auyero's book fulfils two principle goals: the first is to depict daily life of those who live at the bottom of social structure in the Argentinian society which still suffers from neoliberal transformation; the second is to chronicle the ways in which the urban poor interact with a state that presumably cares for their plight. Moreover, the book reconstructs daily routines that constitute the daily labour of normalizing waiting and dissects the ways in which waiting (re)creates subordination by producing uncertainty and arbitrariness.

The book is divided into five chapters, preceded by the *Introduction* and followed by *Conclusion*, *Epilogue* and *Methodological Appendix*. In the first chapter, the author draws upon classic works in fiction (such as Márquez, Beckett and Kafka) and social sciences literature in an attempt to explain the apparent eternal character of poor people's waiting. After providing statistical description of Argentina's trends in poverty and inequality, the second chapter scrutinizes three interrelated forms of regulating mass misery, labelled by the author visible fists, clandestine kicks, and invisible tentacles. Visible fists are measures through which the state exercises power against poor people in the form of violence, imprisonment, evictions, and territorial control; clandestine kicks are the violent actions of illegal groups connected with established power holders; and invisible tentacles are less obvious forms of subordination that make the poor silently wait.

The third chapter illustrates how described forms of regulation operate in the daily life or the urban poor. It starts with the episode of arson in shantytown Villa Cartón to show the precarious character of shantytown dwellers in Buenos Aires and centrality of waiting in their lives. It continues with an ethnography of obtaining national identity cards at the offices of RENAPER, highlighting arbitrariness and uncertainty imposed via long delays on the most vulnerable parts of the Argentine society.

The fourth chapter moves to another site of waiting – the welfare office in Buenos Aires – showing how the patients of the state 'are being manufactured in the ordinary encounters between welfare agents and the poor' (p. 18). In the author's words, 'the welfare office should be thought not simply as a "people processing institution", but as a "people changing operation" [...], that is, a patterned set of interactions with concrete subjective affects' (p. 119).

In the fifth chapter, the author returns to shantytown Flammable, where he conducted research on environmental suffering between 2004 and 2006. He found its residents still severely exposed to toxic hazards and still waiting for relocation or eviction or indemnification. This chapter focuses on the role state agents play in production of "meaningful waiting" and illuminates the investments that deprivileged citizens make on the outcome of long-expected decisions.

In the *Conclusion*, Auyero stresses that 'the work in this book made abundantly clear that there is much more to waiting for state's attention than the kind of boredom and frustration that is the first-order experience of those who encounter that circumstance' (p. 154) and outlines possible avenues of the future research.

This is a timely and ethnographically rich book, which raises essential questions about the relationship between the state and its citizens, particularly most vulnerable ones. It exposes the vital link between their everyday lives, subjectivities and anxieties, and the sphere of politics, arguing for the centrality of the attention 'to poor people's experience of time as a *political artifact*' (p. 155, emphasis in original). It touches upon the essential question of poor people's agency and perceptions of politics, arguing that 'in their interactions with the state, their sense of agency is minimal to nonexistent' (p. 154). They do not see themselves as agents capable of changing the conditions of their existence, and both waiting and politics, seen as something they cannot change or influence, are seen as 'profoundly disempowering processes' (p. 134). For these reasons, Auyero observes the poor of Buenos Aires and their interactions with the state through the "patent model", which could be seen as a 'particular historically situated illustration of the productive nature of power' (p. 157). Seeing the poor as patients of the state exposes the ways in which subordination works, its subjective and everyday effects, as well as mechanisms through which unreliability, unpredictability, arbitrariness and ambiguity that characterize this subordination have the paradoxical effect of binding the poor to the state.

TANJA PETROVIĆ
Scientific Research Centre SAZU (Slovenia)

Hazel, Andrews and Roberts, Les (eds.). 2012. *Liminal Landscapes. Travel, Experience and Spaces In-between (Contemporary Geographies of Leisure, Tourism and Mobility Series).* London, New York: Routledge. 248 pp. Hb: £95.00. ISBN: 9780415668842.

The book is framed as a walk through liminal landscapes that are inhabited, explored and mediated by artists, anthropologists, tourists, migrants, customsmen, memories and waves. Although the routes lead us also across forests, mountain passes and urban settings the majority of the walks take place at the foreshore. The sea, the edgelands, wetlands and estuaries play an pivotal role in this volume. The book consists of four parts: *Navigating Liminality*, *Gleaning and Liminality*, *Urban Liminalities* and *Liminality and Nation*. The introductory chapter by Bjørn Thomassen revisits the concept of liminality and its uses, and opens up a question that runs throughout the whole book: What is happening to liminal spaces in contemporary 'Western' and 'modern' societies?

The first part of the book is navigating through the theories, methods and strategies attached to liminality and stresses the fact that a concept of liminality is today by no means experiencing a revival - 100 years after the concept was introduced by the French anthropologist Arnold van Gennep in his book *Les Rites de Passage,* published in 1909. Later, the importance of liminality was re-discovered in 1967 in Victor Turner's essay on the liminal periods in rites of passage. The authors stress that in anthropology the liminal has in recent decades been connected to the widespread notions of fluid or hybrid culture and has been productively adopted by a growing number of scholars. They also emphasise that the general tendency in much of these contemporary writings has been to positively assert liminality as a vantage point from which to think and represent otherness and articulate diversity. At the same time, the book asserts that we should hesitate to simply follow Turner's and van Gennep's theory and should re-address this question: How can we employ the concept of liminality towards understanding of social, cultural and political processes in modernity? Following this direction, Thomassen, with Arpad Szakolczai, diagnoses modernity as a permanent liminality and state that liminality cannot and should not be considered as a positively asserted endpoint or a desirable state of being. In this way, he returns to Turner's later work and emphasises that liminality serves not only to identify the importance of in-between periods but also to understand the human reaction to liminal experiences. The exploration of liminality in different case studies thus properly follows the general question of human reaction to liminal spaces and understanding of social, cultural and political processes in modernity. Emma Cocker, for example, explores the art project *BorderXing* that is (in Cocker's words) an appropriation rather than actualisation of a rite of passage where the artists' border crossing is performed in the subjunctive mode of "as if". In this art project, the structure of a transitional rite is approached optionally and with a degree of play and it furthermore tests the efficacy of political constraints on human mobility.

In the second part of the book, the reader is introduced to edgelands, wetlands and estuaries. The chapter by Piret Pungas and Ester Võsu analyses both the ecological

and cultural reasons that turn mires into liminal places, they study the natural factors and human practices and beliefs that are conductive of liminality and survey some relevant cultural practices that have transformed the liminality of mires. Les Roberts expand the reader's view towards the 'modern nature' presenting the example of the Dee Estuary, dominated by a nuclear power station and used for military trainings. He explores the social, cultural and historical geography of the Dee Estuary and discusses how structures of liminality have remained deeply embedded in the topography of the region. Kevin Meethan explores liminal spaces by using a method of participant observation through lens, joining the photography and a practice of walking as a method. His walks are performed along the beaches that are framed in Meethan's view as an interface between dry land and the sea and, as such, are both land and water, subject to a daily and seasonal rhythm of tidal movement.

Urban liminalities are presented in the third part of the book through the case studies of liminal urbanscapes in Lhasa; following urban exploration of adventure tourism, and through the link between liminality and Crosby Beach in the north west of England. On the ground of the ethnography at the Crosby Beach Hazel, Andrews discusses the way in which the presence of the art installation intertwines with understandings and practices of the beach and the impact or not on the liminality of space. Ivan Costantino writes about the issue of ritual as recreation leaning on his in-depth ethnographic analysis among young Tibetan rural migrants who moved to the city of Lhasa. He follows their ritual movements and stresses how these movements point to the resilience of traditional approaches to the practice of urban space at a time of immense change. Emma Fraser, in contrast, on the other hand explores "modern ruins" and their role within the adventure tourism in liminal urbanscapes such as Pripyat (Chernobyl) and Gunkanjima in Japan.

The last part of the book explores liminality and nation, tackling issues of marginality, negotiation and contestation in chapters by Simon Ward (exploring British road movies), Anita Howart and Yasmin Ibrahim (writing about newspaper constructions surrounding immigration issues in Britain and France), Pietro Deandrea (exploring the dispersed liminality of contemporary slaveries in UK) and Tom Selwyn, who takes us on another walk along the Rye Bay following a route along the coast from Hastings to Dungeness. He states that exploration of liminal landscapes require us to focus, first, on their natural and built sites, second on the metaphoric and symbolic connotations these generate, and third on the social relations within which both material and symbolic are embedded. In doing so, he redirects the reader's attention back to the matter of landscape that received less attention in this volume and attaches nicely to the David Crouch afterward in which he wrote: 'Landscape is informed through combinations of different times and life durations and rhythms, different registers and intensities of experiences. Landscape is full of liminalities.' (p. 240).

To conclude, the book brings to the fore new directions in the study of liminal spaces and mobility practices in contemporary societies from an interdisciplinary perspective. As such, it achieves employing the concept of liminality towards understanding of social, cultural and political processes in modernity, encompassing both previous theories and the reflection of contemporary case studies on those theories.

Apart from its variety of case-studies and innovative methodological approaches, the volume is also a rich source of references on liminality and mobility and is, as such, a valuable reading for students, researchers and academics in the fields of anthropology, geography and sociology.

NATAŠA ROGELJA
Scientific Research Centre SAZU (Slovenia)